

PRESENTERS

Colin Carruthers QC, Wellington

Colin Carruthers is a Queen's Counsel practising from Chambers in Wellington. His background is as a litigation partner in a major firm. He commenced practice at the Bar in 1987 and was appointed Queen's Counsel in 1990. He has appeared as senior counsel in many major commercial cases. He has also had significant experience in criminal work, including Serious Fraud Office prosecutions, tax prosecutions, securities prosecutions and other regulatory prosecutions. He is a Past President of the New Zealand Bar Association.

Victoria Heine, Chapman Tripp, Wellington

Victoria's background is in general commercial litigation but she has particular expertise in regulatory litigation and enforcement. Her clients are predominantly large corporates in the energy, airport, media, banking and financial services industries. Victoria has acted for a number of directors subject to a financial markets investigations. She is frequently involved in threatened litigation and enforcement actions under the Commerce Act, including in relation to alleged cartels, and potential breaches of the regulations provisions of that Act.

The statements and conclusions contained in this booklet are those of the author(s) only and not those of the New Zealand Law Society. This booklet has been prepared for the purpose of a Continuing Legal Education course. It is not intended to be a comprehensive statement of the law or practice, and should not be relied upon as such. If advice on the law is required, it should be sought on a formal, professional basis.

CONTENTS

- INTRODUCTION..... 1**
- 1. SECTION ONE: OVERVIEW..... 3**
 - A NEW WORLD?..... 3
 - WHERE LIABILITY BEGINS 3
 - THE ROLE OF THE GLOBAL FINANCIAL CRISIS 4
 - THE FINANCIAL MARKETS CONDUCT BILL 6
 - Civil pecuniary penalties* 6
 - Compensatory orders* 7
 - Criminal sanctions*..... 8
 - COMPANIES ACT 1993 9
 - CARTEL BILL 9
 - Penalties* 11
 - Prosecution guidelines* 11
- 2. SECTION TWO: KEY CASES..... 13**
 - NEW ZEALAND CASES 13
 - FELTEX 13
 - Background* 13
 - Analysis* 14
 - Decision*..... 15
 - DAVIDSON 16
 - Background* 16
 - Analysis* 16
 - Decision*..... 18
 - NUPLEX..... 19
 - Background* 19
 - Commentary* 19
 - LOMBARD 20
 - Background* 20
 - Analysis* 21
 - Decision*..... 22
 - BRIDGECORP 23
 - Background* 23
 - High Court Decision*..... 24
 - Court of Appeal* 26
 - NATHANS FINANCE NZ LTD 27
 - Background* 27
 - Analysis* 28
 - Decision*..... 29
 - AUSTRALIAN CASES 30
 - THE JAMES HARDIE CASES 30
 - Background* 30
 - Key findings*..... 31
 - CENTRO 32
 - Background* 32
 - The decision*..... 32
 - Key findings*..... 33
 - OVERVIEW OF THE CURRENT LEGAL POSITION 33
 - Governance v management* 33
 - Directors must exercise their own independent judgment*..... 34
 - Financial literacy is important* 34
 - It is important for directors to understand the business* 35
 - Advice may be relied upon*..... 36
 - But advice should be treated critically* 36

<i>Directors can make mistakes – provided that directors have made all reasonable efforts to avoid error</i>	37
<i>Governance – the legal perspective</i>	37
<i>Some tips</i>	38
3. SECTION THREE: KEY ISSUES	39
DIRECTORS’ ACCESSORY LIABILITY FOR CORPORATE OFFENCES	39
FINANCIAL MARKETS CONDUCT BILL	40
<i>Meaning of “contravene” – accessory liability</i>	40
<i>Overview of the FMC Bill</i>	41
ACCESSORY LIABILITY LEGISLATIVE PROVISIONS CURRENTLY IN FORCE	42
THE SECURITIES MARKETS ACT 1988 ACCESSORY LIABILITY PROVISIONS	42
<i>The Nuplex Settlement – a missed opportunity for clarification of the SMA provisions</i>	43
THE COMMERCE ACT 1986 ACCESSORY LIABILITY PROVISIONS	44
THE LEADING CASE ON ACCESSORY LIABILITY – NEW ZEALAND BUS LTD V COMMERCE COMMISSION	45
<i>Background</i>	45
<i>The High Court decision – Miller J</i>	46
<i>Court of Appeal</i>	48
<i>The Court of Appeal result</i>	52
<i>The Supreme Court to the rescue?</i>	52
<i>An alternative analysis to NZ Bus: Commerce Commission v Koppers Arch Wood</i>	53
<i>What does this all mean? – Conclusions</i>	54
FAIR TRADING ACT 1986	55
<i>The accessory liability requirements – a “wrongful act” with mens rea</i>	56
TAX ADMINISTRATION ACT 1994	57
CONCLUSIONS ON ACCESSORY LIABILITY	59
SENTENCING	60
<i>Penalties in New Zealand cases</i>	60
<i>Penalties in Australian cases</i>	61
DEVELOPMENTS IN DIRECTOR INSURANCE	61
<i>The case</i>	61
<i>The judgment</i>	62
<i>The insurance industry’s response</i>	62
<i>Other Issues</i>	63
DOCUMENT RETENTION	64
<i>Deeds of indemnity</i>	65
THE USE OF EVIDENCE OBTAINED FOR THE PURPOSES OF CIVIL PROCEEDINGS IN SUBSEQUENT CRIMINAL PROCEEDINGS AGAINST DIRECTORS	66
<i>The relevant statutory powers</i>	67