

## PRESENTERS



### **Sarah Devoy, Lee Salmon Long, Auckland**

Sarah has spent more than a decade specialising in commercial litigation and dispute resolution. Formerly a senior associate at a top tier law firm, she has recently joined Lee Salmon Long, a litigation firm that specialises in commercial disputes. Sarah has acted for a range of clients in disputes before the courts, arbitrators and mediators. She has expertise in contractual disputes, commercial lease disputes, estate litigation and insolvency.



### **Natalie Miller, Simpson Grierson, Auckland**

Natalie is a senior associate specialising in commercial dispute resolution, including negotiations and court proceedings. Her areas of expertise include commercial and civil disputes, with a particular focus on debt recovery, commercial lease enforcement/disputes, and enforcing contracts. Natalie regularly acts for and is engaged in disputes involving commercial landlords, but has also acted for clients on a range of other matters including debt recovery disputes, insolvency matters, land transport matters, and relationship property disputes.

### **Acknowledgement**

*This webinar is sourced from the In Short delivered at the NZLS CLE Ltd, Issues in Cancellation of Commercial Contracts and Leases (23 August 2016).*

*The statements and conclusions contained in this booklet are those of the author(s) only and not those of the New Zealand Law Society. This booklet has been prepared for the purpose of a Continuing Legal Education course. It is not intended to be a comprehensive statement of the law or practice, and should not be relied upon as such. If advice on the law is required, it should be sought on a formal, professional basis.*

Cover and text stocks used in this publication are from Forestry Stewardship Council certified mills, manufactured under the environmentally responsible paper manufactured environmental management system ISO 14001, using pulp from well managed forests and other controlled sources.

# CONTENTS

<b>1. PART ONE: ISSUES IN CANCELLATION OF COMMERCIAL CONTRACTS .....</b>	<b>3</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	3
<b>2. CONTRACTUAL REMEDIES ACT 1979 .....</b>	<b>5</b>
CANCELLATION OF CONTRACT .....	5
CANCELLATION FOR BREACH OF CONTRACT .....	5
AFFIRMATION .....	6
WHEN CANCELLATION TAKES EFFECT .....	7
FORM OF CANCELLATION .....	7
<b>3. ESSENTIALITY – A CLOSER LOOK .....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>4. LEADING CASE ON ESSENTIALITY – KUMAR V STATION PROPERTIES LTD .....</b>	<b>11</b>
FACTS .....	11
HIGH COURT – SPECIFIC PERFORMANCE AND SUMMARY JUDGMENT .....	12
FURTHER FACTS.....	13
THE KEY ISSUE .....	13
CONTEXT .....	13
THE CONTRACTUAL ARRANGEMENTS .....	14
ESSENTIAL TERM(S).....	14
<i>Practical completion</i> .....	14
<i>The one percent purchase fee</i> .....	15
<i>The furniture package</i> .....	16
<i>The Management Agreement</i> .....	16
JUDGMENTS .....	17
<i>High Court Decision</i> .....	17
<i>Court of Appeal Decision</i> .....	18
<i>Supreme Court Decision</i> .....	18
RECALL APPLICATION .....	19
<b>5. TEST FOR DETERMINING ESSENTIALITY IN NEW ZEALAND .....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>6. CASES CITING KUMAR V STATION PROPERTIES .....</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>7. CANCELLATION LETTERS .....</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>8. REMEDIES AND RELIEF (IN BRIEF) .....</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>9. KEY MESSAGES.....</b>	<b>29</b>
<b>10. PART TWO: ISSUES IN CANCELLATION OF COMMERCIAL LEASES.....</b>	<b>31</b>
<b>11. INTRODUCTION TO THE PLA .....</b>	<b>33</b>
CANCELLATION CODE (LEASES AND LICENCES).....	33
THE LESSOR’S RIGHT TO CANCEL.....	33
<i>Cancellation for breach of lease</i> .....	33
<i>Cancellation for other reasons</i> .....	34
THE LESSEE’S RIGHT TO CANCEL .....	34
<b>12. NOTICES OF INTENTION TO CANCEL .....</b>	<b>35</b>
THE REQUIREMENT TO GIVE NOTICE.....	35
THE FORM OF PLA NOTICES .....	35
THE CONTENT OF PLA NOTICES .....	35
<i>Breach of covenant to pay rent (s 245)</i> .....	35
<i>Breach of other covenant (s 246)</i> .....	36
EXPLAINING THE NATURE AND EXTENT OF THE BREACH .....	37
NOTICE PERIODS .....	38
<i>Breach of covenant to pay rent (s 245 notice) – “not less than 10 working days”</i> .....	38
<i>Breach of other covenant (s 246 notice) – “a period that is reasonable in the circumstances”</i> .....	39
<i>Multiple breaches</i> .....	40
SERVICE OF PLA NOTICES .....	40

- WHAT IF THE LESSEE HAS ABANDONED THE PREMISES? ..... 41
- WAIVER/ACCEPTANCE OF RENT AFTER ISSUING PLA NOTICE ..... 41
- 13. CANCELLATION METHODS ..... 43**
  - PEACEABLE RE-ENTRY..... 43
  - SEEKING AN ORDER FOR POSSESSION ..... 44
- 14. LESSEE’S RIGHT TO RELIEF ..... 45**
  - WHEN WILL RELIEF BE GRANTED? ..... 45
    - Relief sought where breach complained of is a failure to pay rent* ..... 45
    - Relief sought where breach complained of is something other than a failure to pay rent*..... 46
  - WHAT TYPE OF RELIEF IS AVAILABLE? ..... 46
- 15. CASE STUDY: *STYLO V HUM* LITIGATION..... 49**
- 16. COSTS..... 53**
- 17. KEY MESSAGES..... 55**
- 18. APPENDIX 1 - EXCERPT FROM THE SUPREME COURT’S DECISION IN *KUMAR V STATION* [2015] NZSC 34 RE: SECTION 7 OF THE CONTRACTUAL REMEDIES ACT 1979 ..... 57**
- 19. APPENDIX 2 – THE SUPREME COURT’S “FRAMEWORK FOR ANALYSIS” AS CONTAINED IN ITS DECISION IN *KUMAR V STATION* [2015] NZSC 34 ..... 61**